Power Electronics & Electric Systems (PE&ES), School of Industrial Engineering (University of Extremadura)

# Supercapacitors: Alternative Energy Storage Systems

**Abstract**-The use of supercapacitors as energy storage systems is evaluated in this work. Supercapacitors are compared with other technologies such as compressed air, pumped hydro, superconductors and flywheels. This paper is focused on medium scale energy storage systems (applied to 100 kW photovoltaic generation plants). The supercapacitor is studied in detail, presenting these device structures, how they can be modeled, the balancing, their useful life and their principal applications. The overview is carried out after a detailed reference selection.

# Streszczenie.

Keywords: Overview, supercapacitor, Energy Storage Systems Słowakluczowe:

#### Introduction

Humanity is demanding a bigger quantity of energy as its level of development is growing. Conventional energy resources are limited, so authorities and governments are promoting energy savings and energetic efficiency. Also, renewable energies have been sustained and promoted by these authorities and governments as an alternative to limited conventional energy resources.

Nowadays, the most relevant renewable energies used in generation plants are solar (photovoltaic or thermal) and wind energy. The main disadvantage of these kinds of renewable energy is its generation discontinuity, as well as the fact that its energy generation is not controlled by the system operator thus making it more difficult to integrate these plants in the generation pool than in the case of conventional plants.

Energy storage becomes a critical factor that can solve the problems described above. A renewable energy generation plant with its corresponding energy storage system can behave as a constant power generation plant (following the reference power generation given by the regulator), at least for time intervals in the order of half an hour to a day, depending on the energy storage capacity.

In the first section of this paper, an overview of different energy storage systems is carried out, taking into account storage capacity, voltage and current ratios, and energy availability. The second section is focused on the supercapacitor technology.

# **Energy Storage Systems**

The principal energy storage systems (ESS) are summarized in Fig. 1 [1], where these systems are classified according to their application. We will focus this paper on the systems classified into the Large Scale (>50 kW) in this figure.

Most relevant ESS technology characteristics are summarized in Table I [2]. The ESS considered for medium scale applications are classified in Fig. 2 by their power and energy densities [2].

#### A. CAES (Compressed Air Energy Storage)

CAES uses the peaks of energy generated by renewable energy plants to run a compressor that compresses the air into a hermetic underground reservoir or surface vessel/piping. The compressed air is used, combined with a variety of fuels in a combustion turbine to generate electric energy when demand is high. The energy storage capacity depends on deposit volume and maximum storage pressure of the compressed air. Start up time is







Fig. 2. Power versus energy.

usually high. [1]-[12]. CAES is used for large and medium (micro CAES) scale systems.

#### B. Pumped Hydroelectric

Pumped hydroelectric storage has been commonly used for 70 years. These plants are the most used for large scale applications at present [7],[13].

#### C. Superconducting Magnets

A Superconducting Magnetic Energy Storage (SMES, Fig. 3) system stores the energy as magnetic energy in a superconducting magnet cryogenically cooled, achieving a system with negligible losses. The AC energy is stored as DC energy and brought back from DC to AC energy from the superconducting magnet by a reversible AC/DC Power Converter Module (PCM).

The superconducting magnet can present two different shapes: toroid or solenoid. The first has a lower external field but higher superconductor and components cost than the second.

Table 1: Energy storage technologies

Technology	Power	Energy density	Back-up time	Response time	Efficiency	Lifetime (years)
Pumped hydro	100 MW – 2 GW	400 MWh - 20 GWh	hours	12 minutes	70 - 80 %	50
CAES	110 MW - 290 MW	1.16 GWh - 3 GWh	hours	12 minutes	99 %	< 50
BESS	100  W - 100  MW	1 kWh - 200 MWh	hours	seconds	60 - 80 %	< 10
Flywheels	5 kW – 90 MW	5  kWh - 200  kWh	minutes	12 minutes	80 - 95 %	20
SMES	170 kW - 100 MW	110 Wh – 27 kWh	seconds	milliseconds	95%	30
Supercapacitors	< 1 MW	1 Wh- 1kWh	seconds	milliseconds	> 95%	> 10

The energy stored by an SMES is

$$E = \frac{1}{2}LI^2$$

where L is the equivalent self-inductance of the superconductor system, and I is the DC current that flows trough the winding. This current is the principal magnitude that the PCM uses for controlling the energy stored or generated by the system [14], [15].

SMES efficiency is between 95 % and 98 %. It has a high availability, being able to supply high energy quantity in time intervals of milliseconds [4], [7], [16], [17].

First SMES systems (in the 1970s) were focused for large scale applications, with energy storage capacities between 1,000 and 10,000 MWh [18], powers about 1,000 MW (for 5,000 MWh applications [16],[18]) and were underground systems [17]. Application of superconducting in SMES took place for the first time in 1974 in Los Alamos National Laboratory (LANL) [19] using a three-phase converter. Bonneville Power Authority (BPA) and LANL team designed in 1976 a SMES of 8.33 kWh (30 MJ) and 10 MW [17],[19]. At present, typical SMES Systems are designed with an energy storage capacity of from 0.15 kWh (600 kJ) to 28 kWh (100 MJ) [20]-[22].

The main disadvantage of the SMES system is that the energy density is low and there is a need for a criogenization system that could be very complex for large scale application. A possible solution is to combine them in hybrid ESS increasing their energy and power [23].

# D. Flywheels

Due to their simplicity, flywheel energy storage systems (FESS, Fig. 4) have been widely used in commercial small units (about 3 kWh) in the range of from 1 kW - 3 hours to 100 kW - 3 seconds [7].

Energy is stored as kinetic energy using a rotor that rotates with high angular speed

$$E = \frac{1}{2}J\omega^2$$

where J is the momentum of inertia and  $\omega$  is the angular velocity.

The rotor is a hollow cylinder and has magnetic bearings to minimize the friction. The rotor is located in a vacuum pipe to decrease the friction even more. The rotor is integrated into a motor/generator machine that allows the energy flow in both directions.

The energy storage capacity depends on the mass and shape of the rotor and on the maximum available angular velocity.

There exist two topologies, *slow* flywheels (with angular velocity below 6,000 rpm) based on steel rotors, and *fast* flywheels (below 60,000 rpm) that use advanced material rotors (carbon fiber or glass fiber) that present a higher energy and power density than steel rotors [24].

The flywheel designs are modular and systems of 10 MW are possible [7][25]. FESS presents an efficiency of 80-85 %, with a useful life of 20 years.



Fig. 3. SMES (200 kW, 2 MJ. Thanks to ACCEL).



Fig. 4. Flywheel Energy Storage System (ENERCON, 200 kW, 5 kWh. Thanks to PEGE).

The advances on the rotor technology and on the PCM for FESS have permitted a high dynamic and a high durability of tenths of thousands of cycles [25]. These characteristics make these systems suitable for power quality applications: frequency deviations, temporary interruptions), voltage sags and voltage swells.

Smart Energy Matrix is a commercial system by Beacon Power, composed of a Flywheel ESS and PCM [25]. At present, two pilot projects using Smart Energy Matrix for large scale applications are being carried out by the Department of Energy (DOE), California Energy Commission (CEC) and the New York State Energy Reseach and Development Authority (NYSERDA). The first Project is located in an industrial zone of New York; the second one is connected to a transmission line in a substation of California. Both projects prove the FESS capacity for improving power quality [28].

FESS applied to the renewable energies trend is to combine them with other technologies, like micro CAES or thermal energy storage systems [27].

# E. Batteries

These systems could be located in any place and be rapidly installed. Large systems (known as Battery Energy Storage System, BESS, Fig. 5) don't have the medioambiental impact of other ESS technologies and can be located in a building (or similar) near the point of demand [26].

BESS uses a PCM to convert the battery DC energy into AC grid-compatible energy. These units present fast dynamics with response times near 20 miliseconds and an efficiency from 60 % to 80 % [7].

The energy is stored as electro-chemical energy. The battery temperature change during charge and discharge cycles must be controlled because it affects its life expectancy.

Depending on how the battery and cycle are, the BESS can require multiple charges and discharges per day. The battery cycles will be normal while the discharge depth is small, but if the discharge depth is high the battery cycle duration could be degraded. The expectated useful life of a Ni-Cd battery is 20,000 cycles if the discharge depth is limited to 15% [1].

Large scale BESSs that exist at present are the 10 MW (40 MWh) system installed in Chino, California and the 20 MW (5 MWh) installed in Puerto Rico [7], [28].

New battery technologies are being developed for a higher energy store capacity and at a lower cost than the Lead Acid battery. Some of these new technologies are Lithium Ion, Hydrogen Vanadium Redox, Regenesys® Redox, Sodium Sulfur, Nickel Metal Hydride, Nickel Cadmium, and Zinc Bromide [29]-[31].

# F. Supercapacitors (ultracapacitors)

Supercapacitors will be presented in more detail in the next section.

# **Supercapacitors**

Supercapacitors, ultracapacitors (commercial denominations given originally by its manufactures Nippon Electric Company, NEC, in Japan, and by Pinnacle Research Institute, PRI, in USA) or electrochemical double-layer capacitor (EDLC, technical name) are devices that can be used as energy storage systems, that have high energy and power densities, a high efficiency, nearly 95% and a large life expectancy [32]-[34].

Supercapacitors store charge in a similar way to conventional capacitors, but the charge does not accumulate in two conductors, but in the interface between the surface of a conductor and an electrolytic solution.

Supercapacitor devices consist of two electrodes which allow a potential to be applied across the cell, therefore they present two double-layers, one at each electrode/electrolyte interface. An ion-permeable separator is placed between the electrodes in order to prevent electrical contact, but still allows ions from the electrolyte to pass through. The electrodes are made with high effective surface materials, such as porous carbon or carbon aerogel. Two principal technologies are used: aqueous (maximum voltage of 1.2 V and work voltage of 0.9 V) and organic (voltage near 3 V but with a much higher series resistance).

The principal supercapacitor characteristic that makes it suitable for using in ESS, is the possibility of fast charge and discharge without lost of efficiency, for thousands of cycles.

This is because they store electrical energy directly [35]-[37]. Supercapacitors can recharge in a very short time having a great facility to supply high and frequent power demand peaks.

Supercapacitor can be manufactured in any size because they do not need a dielectric, form high capacitance supercondensators for hybrid vehicles [2], [38]-[41], to small capacitance ones to be used in low power applications such as wireless systems [42]-[43].



Fig. 5. Battery Energy Storage System (ZESS 50, 50kWh, 25kWh).



Fig. 6. Supercapacitor models: (a) RC parallel branch model, (b) RC branches series-parallel model, (c) RC transmission line model, and (d) first-order circuit supercapacitor model.



Fig. 7. The 48V series BMOD0165P048B supercapacitor (courtesy of MAXWELL).

# A. Supercapacitors principles and models

Supercapacitors are based on the same physical principles as conventional capacitors, but the first ones present a higher area and thinner electrodes (with lower electrodes distances) than the second ones. This increases the capacitance values and the energy that can store.

An estimation of the capacitance value can be obtained from the double-layer model proposed by Helmholtz in 1853, considering the double-layer charge as two charge monolayers. The specific capacitance of such a doublelayer is given by

(3) 
$$C = \varepsilon_0 \varepsilon_r \frac{A}{D}$$

where *C* is the capacitance,  $\varepsilon_0$  the dielectric constant of free space,  $\varepsilon_r$  the dielectric constant of the medium between the two layers, *A* the surface area, and *D* is the distance between the two layers ( the distance from the electrode surface to the centre of the ion layer). This approximation is roughly correct for concentrated electrolytic solutions [34].

The energy stored in a supercapacitor, as in a conventional capacitor, is

$$(4) E = \frac{1}{2}CV$$

where V is the supercapacitor voltage.

The simplest equivalent circuit to model a supercapacitor is a capacitor, *C*, with an equivalent series resistance (ESR), *R*, which represents the Joule losses[44].

More detailed supercapacitor *RC* models are various parallel *RC* branches (Fig. 6(a)) [44], [46]; *RC* seriesparallel branches (Fig. 6(b)) [44], [46]; and transmission line model (Fig. 6(c)) [44]-[47]. These models are linear presenting fixed capacitance and resistance values. Sometimes non linear models must be used considering capacitance or resistance values that depend on the temperature and supercapacitor voltage [44], [48], [49].

In Fig. 6(d) other equivalent circuit is shown that includes a series inductor, L, and a parallel resistance,  $R_P$  [50]-[52].  $R_S$  (ESR) models the energy losses in charges and discharges and  $R_P$  models the escape current and the energy losses due to the capacitor self-discharge. In practical capacitors  $R_P$  is much higher than  $R_S$ .

One of the most useful/desirable characteristics of an SAE is that the discharge is minimum. The discharge process of a supercondenser is controlled by the equation:

(5) 
$$V(t) = V_C(0)e^{-\frac{R_pC}{R_pC}}$$

where  $V_c(0)$  is the initial voltage of the supercapacitor. The stored energy in the supercapacitor being:

(6) 
$$E(t) = \frac{1}{2} C V_C^{-2}(0) e^{-\frac{2t}{R_p C}}$$

The evolution of the supercapacitor tension in the discharge is shown in Fig. 8 [53][54].

Associating Supercapacitors in series/parallel structures needs circuits to balance the voltage and current of each individual supercapacitor. Two principal kinds of methods exist to implement this balance:

- Active Method: this method uses semiconductors to limit and balance the tension between cells; it is the best method for cycles of ardous work/long cycles of work, or when effeciency (or losses in the escape current) are an important factor [55].
- Resistive Method: here a parallel resistance is installed; the force of this resistance is calculated as 10 times less than the parallel resistance for slow dynamic requisites, and 100 times less than for rapid dynamic requisites. In this method the efficiency of the system is considerably reduced [55].

In Fig. 9 we can see two circuits of actively balanced cells developed by Maxwell. Both versions are based on a design of a precision operated amplifier. The tension-balancing circuit between cells is designed to limit an overload in the supercapacitors and is capable of supplying a current of up to 300 mA to reduce overload in the cells. Once the cells are balanced the circuit reduces this current to a force of less than 50  $\mu$ A (approximately 1% of the normal escape current in a cell of 3000 F) guaranteeing that the balancing circuit does not notably affect the efficiency or the discharge periods of the system.

The modular systems of Maxwell, e.g. BMOD0165, are now equipped with an active tension-balancing circuit, which protects and monitors every cell within the module. Balancing between different modules is therefore not necessary as each module is balanced internally.

The criteria which determine the life of the supercapacitors are capacity and ERS. Maxwell defines this criteria as a reduction of 20% in capacity and a 100%



Fig. 8. Courtesy of Maxwell Technologies. Discharge of the supercapacitor due to escape resistances.



300mA Balancer

Fig. 9. Courtesy of Maxwell Technologies. Balancing circuits of Maxwell technologies



Fig. 10. Courtesy of Maxwell Technologies. Changes in the value of internal parameters of the supercapacitor during its useful life

Table 2: Capacitance of Selected Electrode Material

Electrode Material	DENSITY (G/CM <sup>3</sup> )	Electrolyte	F/G	F/CM 3
CARRON CLOTH	0.35	KOH	200	70
CARBON CLOTH		ORGANIC	100	35
CARBON BLACK	1.0	KOH	95	95
AEROGEL CARBON	0.6	KOH	140	84
PARTICULATE FROM	0.7	КОН	175	126
SIC		ORGANIC	100	72
PARTICULATE FROM	0.5	КОН	220	110
TIC		ORGANIC	120	60
ANHYDROUS RUO <sub>2</sub>	2.7	$H_2SO_4$	150	405
HYDROUS RUO <sub>2</sub>	2.0	$H_2SO_4$	650	1300
DOPED CONDUCTING POLYMERS	0.7	ORGANIC	450	315

increase in ERS.The capacity descends/drops in the first hours/cycles in an exponential form, and then in a lineal form during the rest of its useful life (Fig. 10). Although a recovery phenomenon exists if the tension in the supercapacitor is interrupted after a long period of continuous use, both capacity and ERS show this recovery as a rest period function.

				TABLE : MANUFACTURERS OF SU	3 UPERCAPACITORS				
Type of composites	Company or lab	Country	Device name	Capacitance range (F)	Voltage range (V)	Energy density (Wh/kg)	Power density (kW/kg)	Mass (Kg)	Web address
Carbon fiber	llawveM	I Initad Statas	Boostcap	4 - 3000	2.5 - 2.7	0.868 - 5.52	1.35 - 26	0,004 - 0,55	moo llawven www
composites		SUBG DOITO	Boostcap Modulen	52 - 500	15 - 125	1.9 - 3.98	4.4 - 14	0.566 - 58	
	APowerCap Technologies	Sweden/Ukraine		4 - 550	2.7	5.5 - 5.8	4.4-5.7	1	www.apowercap.com
	NIPPON CHEMI-	Japan	Electric Double Layer Capacitor Mcdule	58 - 500	13.8 - 210	1.5 - 4.5	1	1 - 445	www.chemi-con.co.jp
	CON	1	Electric Double Layer Capacitor	350 - 3200	2.3 - 2.5	1.5 - 4.5	1	0.09 - 520	
carbon particulate composites	Nesscap	korea	EDLC Pseudocapacitor Mcdule	1.5 - 5000	2.3 - 340	1.67 - 8.75	5.2	0.001 - 384	www.nesscap.com
	Cap XX	Australia	Supercapacitor	0.075 - 1.8	2.3 - 5.5	0.05 - 10	0.01 - 10.3	I	www.cap-xx.com
	ELIT	Russia	UPS type xxxIIII-x/0,xx	2,86 - 0,23	0,8 - 200	0,556 - 2,778	0.9-1		www.elit-cap.com
	NEC	Japan	Super Capacitors	0.022 - 100	2.7 - 7.0	0.5	0.005-0.01	4.5 - 24	www.nec-tokin.com
	Panasonic	Japan	Gdd capacitor	800 - 2000	ю	3.1 - 4.4	0.127 - 0.392	0.32 - 0.57	
Aerogel carbon	Cooper Electronic Technologies (COOPER Bussmann)	United States	PowerStor	0.22 - 100	2.5 - 5.5	0,4	1	0.0005 - 0,022	www.cooperet.com
	WIMA	Germany	SuperCap	100 - 3000	2.5 - 14	1.5 - 4.7	0.25	40 - 1700	www.wima.de
	Evans	United States	Hybrid (DSCC) Capacitor Banks Capattery	0.001 - 1.5	5.5 - 125	0,1	30		www.evanscap.com
Hybrid	ESMA	Russia	Capacitor Modules	100 - 500	16 - 52	2,58 - 7,3	38 - 42	,	www.esma-cap.com

#### B. Supercapacitor estructure and manufacturers

Supercapacitor structure consists of two electrodes of active carbon (built with porous or aerogel carbon to maximize the electrode surface) that are isolated by a permeable membrane (electrolitic impregnated and isolating) that allows the ionic conduction between them.

These electrodes are wound in layers and introduced into rectangular containers [50].

The supercapacitor capacitance depends principally on the electrode material: distribution and size of the porous. In Table II different materials with their respective density and capacitances are shown [32].

At present, research is focused on developing new supercapacitor applications, most of them in electric and hybrid vehicles and in domestic electronic devices.

# C. Applications

As aforementioned, the principal research lines are focused on the use of supercapacitors in hybrid storage systems combined with cell fuel or SMES [54]-[63], because these systems are complementary.

A typical supercapacitor application is its use as a storage system in electric or hybrid vehicles, improving their performance, efficiency and economic viability [66]-[94].

Due to advances in technology and the increase in the energy storage capacity, these Systems are beginning to be considered for energy storage systems in renewable energy generation plants [95]-[98].

Other scenarios where the use of supercapacitor based systems are beginning to be researched are: active power filters [99]-[101]; power quality improvement of distribution and transport systems [57], [102]-[105]; locomotives [2]; for battery substitution in electronic devices (due to their large useful life) [106]-[107]; intermediate energy storage systems [108]; and in whatever medium level power application that requires an energy storage of high reponse times, low instalation and maintenance costs, and small energy storage capacity.

## Conclusion

In this paper, the six ESS technologies which have been described, namely battery energy storage system (BESS), compressed air energy storage system (CAES), flywheel energy storage system (FESS), pumped hydroelectric, supercapacitor energy storage system (SESS), and superconducting magnetic energy storage (SMES), are applied for power fluctuation suppression in the renewable energy. The study focuses on supercapacitors, due to their easy installation and use, their storage of electrical energy and the great technological development experienced in the last years.

Supercapacitors are actually available with energy densities around 5 Wh/kg, still relatively low densities with a high cost. It is expected that in the future their energy density will reach 30 Wh/kg. This leads us to consider supercapacitors as an interesting option in a near future when problems of high cost and low energy density are solved.

Nowadays, supercapacitors would be a solution to a system that injects power for one hour, but they wouldn't be a solution to a system that injects power for one day. The fact that they don't store high quantities of energy and that they need a high number of modules increases the costs a lot.

## References

[1] S.C. Smith, P.K. Sen, B. Kroposki, "Advancement of energy storage devices and applications in electrical power system", *Power and Energy Society General Meeting - Conversion and Delivery of Electrical Energy in the 21st Century*, 2008 IEEE, 20-24 July 2008; Page(s): 1 - 8.

[2] S. Colel, D. Van Hertem, L. Meeus, and R. Belmans, "The influence of renewables and international trade on investment decisions in the grid of the future", *ICREPQ'06 International Conference on Renewable Energies and Power Quality*, 8 pages, April 2006.

[3] C. R. Akli, X. Roboam, B. Sareni, A. Jeunesse, "Energy management and sizing of a hybrid locomotive", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics and Applications*, Page(s):1-10, September 2007

[4] Robert B. Schainker, "Executive Overview: Energy Storage Options For A Sustainable Energy Future", *IEEE Power Engineering Society General Meeting*, Page(s):2309-2314, vol. 2, June 2004

[5] Kemit Allen, "CAES: The Underfround Portion", *IEEE Transactions on Power Apparatus and Systems*, vol. PAS-104, No. 4, pp. 809-812, April 1985.

[6] D. R. Mack, "Something New in Power Technology", *Potentials IEEE*,vol. 12, Issue 2, pp.40-42, April 1993

[7] Robert B. Schainker, "Executive overview: Energy Storage ptions For a Sustainable Energy Future", *IEEE Power Eginnering Society General Meeting*, pp. 2309-2314, June 2004

[8] R. B. Schainker, and M.Nakhamkin, "Compressed-AirEnergy Storage (CAES): Overview, Performance and Cost Data for 25 MW to 220 MW Plants", *IEEE Transactions on Power Apparatus and Systems*, vol. PAS-1004, No 4, pp.791-795, April 1985.

[9] Derk J. Swider, "Compressed Air Energy Storage in an Electricity System with Significant Wind Power Generation", *IEEE Transactions on Energy Conversion*, vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 95-102, March 2007.

Energy Conversion, vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 95-102, March 2007. [10] S. Lemofouet, and A. Rufer, "Hybrid Energy Storage Systems based on Compressed Air and Supercapacitors with Maximun Efficiency Point Tracking", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics and Applications*, Page(s):10, 11-14 Sept. 2005

[11]S. Lemofouet and A. Rufer, "Hybrid Energy Storage Systems based on Compressed Air and Supercapacitors with Maximun Efficiency Point Tracking", *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*, vol. 53, No. 4, August 2006

[12]H. Ibrahim, A.Ilinca, R.Younès, J.Perron, T.Basbous, "Study of a Hybrid Wind-Diesel System with Compressed Air Energy Storage", *IEEE Conference on Canada Electrical Power*, Page(s):320-325, October 2007

[13]W. Leonard, and M. Grobe, "Sustainable Electrical Energy Supply with Wind and Pumped Storage–A Realistic Long-Term Strategy or Utopia", *IEEE General Meeting of Power Engineering Society*, pp. 1221-1225, June 2004.

[14] Paulo F. Ribeiro, Brian K. Johnson, Mariesa L. Crow, Aysen Arsoy, and Yilu liu,"Energy Storage Systems for Advance Power Applications", *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 89, No. 12, December 2001, Page(s):1744 - 1756, Vol. 89, No. 12, December 2001

[15]L. Chen, Y. Liu, A.B. Arsoy, P.F. Ribeiro, M. Steurer, M.R.Iravani, "Detailed Modeling of Superconducting Magnetic Energy Storage (SMES) System", *IEEE Transctions on Power Delivery*, vol. 21, No. 2, Aplil 2006.

[16] Chung-Shih Hus and Wei-Jen Lee, "Superconducting Magnetic Energy Storage for Power System Applications", *IEEE Transactions on Industry Applications*, vol.29, No 5, pp 990-996, September/October 1992

[17]C.A. Luongo, "Superconducting Storage Systems: An Overview", *IEEE Transactions on Magnetics*, vol. 32, No. 4, pp.2214-2223, July 1996.

[18] Robert J. Loyd, Susan M. Schoenung, Takashi Nakamura, William V. Hassenzahl, John D. Rogers, John R. Purcell, Dennis W. Lieurance and M. A. Hilal, "Design Advances in Superconducting Magnetic Energy Storage for Electric Utility Load Leveling", *IEEE Transactions on Magnetics*, vol. MAG-23, No. 2, pp.1323-1330, March 1987.

[19] Warren Buckles and William V. Hassenzahl, "Superconducting Magnetic Energy Storage", *IEEE Power Engineering Review*, pp.16-20, May 2000.

[20] Michael Steurer, and Wolfgang Hribernik, "Frequency Response Characteristics of a 100 MJ SMES Coil-Measurements and Model Refinement", *IEEE Transactions on Applied Superconductivity*, vol. 15, No 2, June 2005.

[21] Myungjin Park, Sangyeop Kwak, Wooseok Kim, Jikwang Lee, Jinho Han, Kyeongdal Choi, Hyunkyo Jung, Joonhan Bae, Seokho Kim, Kiduk Sim, Haejong Kim, Kichul Seong, and Songyop Hanh,"Conceptual Design of HTS Magnet for a 5 MJ Class SMES", *IEEE Transactions on Applied Superconductivity*, vol. 18, No. 2, June 2008.

[22] J. W. Cho, H. J. Kim, J. H. Bae, K. D. Sim, and K. C. Seong, "Fabrication and Test of a 3MJ SMES Magnet", *IEEE Transactions on Applied Superconductivity*, vol. 14, No 2, June 2004.

[23] Toshifumi Ise, Masanori Kita, and Akira Taguchi,"A Hybrid Eenrgy Storage with a SMES and Secondary Battery", *IEEE Transactions on Applied Superconductivity*, vol. 15, No. 2, June 2005.

[24]R. de Andrade,A. C. Ferreira,G. G. Sotelo,J. L. S. Neto,L. G. B. Rolim, W. I. Suemitsu,M. F. Bessa,R. M. Stephan,and R.Nicolsky, "Voltage sags compensation using a superconducting

flywheel energy storage system", *IEEE Trans. Appl. Supercond.*, vol. 15, N°. 2, pp. 2265–2268, Jun. 2005.

[25] Matthew L. Lazarewicz and Alex Rojas, "Grid Frequency Regulation by Recycling Electrical Energy in Flywheels", *IEEE General Meeting of Power Engineering Society*, vol. 2, pp.2038-2042, June 2004.

[26] Matthew L. Lazarewicz and James A. Arseneaux, "Status of Pilot Projects Using Flywheels for Frequency Regulation", *IEEE General Meeting of Power Engineering Society*, Page(s): 3, 18-22 June 2006.

[27] J. R. Sears, "TEX: The next generation of energy storage technology", *in Proc. 26thAnnu. Int. Telecommun. Energy Conf.*, Sep. 2004, pp. 218–222.

[28] W.R. Lachs and D. Sutanto, "Applications of Battery Energy Storage in Power Systems", *IEEE Catalogue* No. 95 TH8025, pp. 700-705, 1995.

[29] Jim McDowall, "Nickel-Cadmium Batteries for Energy Storage Applications", *in Proc.* 1999 *IEEE Battery Conference on Applications and Advances*, pp. 303-308, 1999.

[30] John P. Barton and David G. Infield, "Energy Storage and Its Use With Intermittent Renewable Energy", *IEEE Transactions on Energy Conversion*, vol. 19, No. 2, pp.441-448, June 2004.

[31] Phillip C. Symons, "Opportunities for Energy Storage in Stressed Electrical Supply Systems", *IEEE Meeting of Power Engineering Society Winter*, vol. 1, pp. 448-449, July 2001.

[32] A. Burke, "Ultracapacitors: Why, how, and where is the technology", *J. Power Sources*, vol. 91, pp. 37–50, 2000

[33] Y. Y. Yao, D. L. Zhang, and D. G. Xu, "A Study of Supercapacitor Parameters and Characteristics", *IEEE Conference on Power System Technology*, Page(s):1 - 4, October 2006

[34] Tongzhen Wei, Sibo Wang, Zhiping Qi, "A Supercapacitor Based Ride-Throungh System for Industrial Drive Applications", *IEEE Conference on Mechatronics and Automation*, Page(s):3833 - 3837, August 2007

[35] John M. Miller, "Electrical and Thermal Performance of the Carboncarlbon Ultracapacitor under Constant Power Conditions", *IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s): 559-566, September 2007.

[36]G. Alcicek, H. Gualous, P. Venet, R. Gallay, A. MIraoui, "Experimental Study of temperature effect on Ultracapacitor ageing", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics and Applications*, Page(s):1 - 7, September 2007

[37] Supratim Basu", voltage and Current Ripple Considerations for Improving Lifetime of Ultra-Capacitors used for Energy Buffer Applications at Converter Inputs", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics Specialists*, Page(s):1453 - 1457, June 2007

[38] Shuai Lu, Keith A. Corzine, and Mehdi Ferdowsi, "A New Battery/Ultracapacitor Energy Storage System Design and Its Motor Drive Integration for Hybrid Electric Vehicles", *IEEE Transactions on vehicular technology*, vol. 56, No. 4, Juny 2007.

[39] Yee-Pien Yang, Jieng-Jang Liu, Tsan-Jen Wang, Kun-Chang Kuo, and Pu-En Hsu, "An Electric Gearshift With Ultracapacitors for the Power Train of an Electric Vehicle With a Directly Driven Wheel Motor", *IEEE Transactions on vehicular technology*, vol. 56, No.5 September 2007.

[40] M.Ortúzar, J. Moreno, and J. Dixon, "Ultracapacitor-Based Auxiliary Energy System for an Electric Vehicle: Implementacion and Evaluation", *IEEE Transactions on industrial electronics*, vol. 54, No. 4, Agust 2007

[41] D.Rotenberg, A.Vahidi, I.Kolmanovsky, "Ultracapacitor Assisted Powertrains: Modeling, Control, Sizing, and The Impact on Fuel Economy", *IEEE Conference on American Control*, Page(s):981 - 987, June 2008

[42] Simjee, Farhan Chou, Pai H., "Everlast: Long-life, Supercapacitoroperated Wireless Sensor Node", *IEEE Symposium on Low Power Electronics and Design*, Page(s):197-202, October 2006.

[43] F.I. Simjee, and P.H. Chou, "Efficient Charging of Supercapacitors for Extended Liftime of Wireless Sensor Nodes", *IEEE Transactions on power electronics, vol. 23, No. 3, May 2008.* 

[44]D. McIntosh, P. Mars, "Using a Supercapacitor to Power Wireless Nodes from a Low Power Source such as a 3V Button Battery", *Sixth International Conference on Information Technology: New Generations*, 2009. ITNG '09. Page(s): 69-78, 27-29 April 2009.

[45] Lisheng Shi, and M.L. Crow, "Comparison of Ultracapacitor Electric Circuit Models", IEEE Power and Energy Society General Meeting -Conversion and Delivery of Electrical Energy in the 21st Century, Page(s):1 - 6, July 2008

[46] Tongzhen Wei, Xinchun Qi, Zhiping Qi, "An Improved Ultracapacitor Equivalent Circuit Model for the Design of Energy Storage Power Systems", *IEEE Conference on Electrical Machines and Systems*, Page(s):69 - 73, October 2007.

[47] Qi Xin-chun, Qi Zhi-ping, Li Haidong, "Asymmetric Hybrid Supercapacitor(AHS)'s Modeling Based on Physical Reasoning", *IEEE conference on Electric Utility Deregulation and Restructuring and Power Technologies*, Page(s):2682-2685, April 2008. [48]H. Gualous, H. Louahlia-Gualous, R. Gallay, A. Miraoui, "Supercapacitor Thermal Modeling and Characterization in Transient State forIndustrial Applications", IEEE Transactions on industry applications, vol 45, N°. 3, may 2009.

[49]A. B. Cultura II, and Z. M. Salameh, "Performance Evaluation of a Supercapacitor Module for Energy Storage Applications", *IEEE General Meeting of Power and Energy Society*, Page(s):1-7, Juli 2008.

Meeting of Power and Energy Society, Page(s):1-7, Juli 2008. [50] H. Gualous, and H. Louahlia-Gualous, "Supercapacitor thermal Characterization in Transient State", *IEEE Conference on Industry Applications*, Page(s):722-729, September 2007.

[51]A. B. Cultura II, and Z. M. Salameh, "Performace Evaluation of a Supercapacitor Module for Energy Storage Applications", IEEE General Meeting of Power and Energy Society, Page(s):1-7, July 2008.

[52] M.Harfman-Todorovic, M.Chellappan, L. Palma, and P. Enjeti, "The Role of Supercapcitors in Designing Fuel Cell Powered Portable Applications", *IEEE Conference on Power Specialists*, Page(s):2465-2472, June 2008.

[53] M.I. Marei, S.J. Samborsky, S.B. Lambert, and M.M.A. Salama, "On the Characterization of Ultracapacitor Banks Used for HEVs", IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion, Page(s):1-6, Sept. 2006.

[54] P. Srithorn, M. Aten, R. Parashar, "Series Connection of Supercapacitor Modules for Energy estorage", IEEE Conference on Power Electronics, Machines and Drives, Page(s)354-360, march, 2006 [55] R. Maher, "High reliability backup for telecommunications using ultracapacitors", IEEE Conference on Telecommunications Energy, Page(s):623 – 625, Sept. 2004.

[56] A. Payman, M. Zandi, S. Pierfederici, P. Liutanakul, F. Meibody-Tabar", Fuel cell characteristic observation to control an electrical multisource/multi-load hybrid system", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics Specialists*, Page(s): 1951-1956, June 2008.

[57] J.Hong, S.Jung, P.D.Thang, K.Nam, "Hybridization fuel cell with supercapacitor for FCEV", *IEEE and Exposition on Applied Power Electronics Conference*, Page(s):286-290, February 2008.

[58] Hanmin Liu, Zhixin Wang, Shutong Qiao, Yunhai Liu, "Improvement of engine cold start capability using supercapacitor and lead-acid battery hybrid", *IEEE Conference and Exposition on Applied Power Electronics*, Page(s):668-675, February 2008.

[59] A. Vahidi, W. Greenwell, "A Decentralized Model Predictive Control Approach to Power Management of a Fuel Cell-Ultracapacitor Hybrid", *IEEE Conference on American Control*, Page(s):5431-5437, July 2007.

[60] D. L. Cheng, M.G. Wismer, "Active Control of Power Sharing in a Battery/Ultracapacitor Hybrid Source", *IEEE conference on Industrial Electronics and Applications*, Page(s):2913-2918, May 2007.

[61]A. Szumanowski, P. Piorkowski, Y. Chang, "Batteries and Ultracapacitors Set in Hybrid Propulsion System", *IEEE Conference on Power Engineering, Energy and Electrical Drives*, Page(s):122-127, April 2007

[62] A. Szumanowski, P. Piorkowski, Y. Chang, "Batteries and Ultracapacitors Set in Hybrid Propulsion System", *IEEE Conference on Power Engineering, Energy and Electrical Drives*, Page(s):122-127, April 2007

[63] Jun Liang, and Chunmei Feng, "Stability Improvement of Microgrids with Coordinate Control of Fuel Cell and Ultracapacitor," *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics Specialists*, Page(s):2472-2477, June 2007.

[64]A. Vahidi, A. Stefanopoulou, H. Peng,"Current Management in a Hybrid Fuel Cell Power System: A Model-Predictive Control Approach", *IEEE Transactions on Control Systems Technology*, Vol.14, No.6, Page(s):1047 - 1057, November 2006.

[65] S. M. Lukic, S.G. Wirasingha, F. Rodriguez, Cao Jian, A. Emadi, "Power Management of an Ultracapacitor/Battery Hybrid Energy Storage System in an HEV", *IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s):1-6, September 2006

[66] D. Rotenberg, A. Vahidi, I. Kolmanovsky, "Ultracapacitor assisted powertrains: Modeling, control, sizing, and the impact on fuel economy", *IEEE Conference on American Control*, Page(s):981 - 987, June 2008.

IEEE Conference on American Control, Page(s):981 - 987, June 2008. [67] P. Thounthong, P. Sethakul, S. Rael, B. Davat, "Performance investigation of fuel cell/battery and fuel cell/supercapacitor hybrid sources for electric vehicle applications", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics, Machines and Drives*, Page(s):455 - 459, April 2008

[68] S huai Lu, K.A. Corzine, M. Ferdowsi, "A New Battery/Ultracapacitor Energy Storage System Design and Its Motor Drive Integration for Hybrid Electric Vehicles", *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, Page(s):1516 - 1523, Vol. 56, No. 4, July 2007.

[69] Yee-Pien Yang, Jieng-Jang Liu, Tsan-Jen Wang, Kun-Chang Kuo, and Pu-En Hsu, "An Electric Gearshift With Ultracapacitors for the Power Train of an Electric Vehicle With a Directly Driven Wheel Motor," *IEEE Transctions on vehicular technology*, vol. 56, No. 5, September 2007.

[70] Jianbo Cao, Binggang Cao, Zhifeng Bai, Wenzhi Chen, "Energy-Regenerative Fuzzy Sliding Mode Controller Design for UltracapacitorBattery Hybrid Power of Electric Vehicle", *IEEE Conference on Mechatronics and Automation*, Page(s):1570 - 1575, August 2007.

 [71] Y. Baghzouz, R. Hurt, R.F. Boehm, "Evaluation of a Fuel Cell for Powering the Electrical Load of ICE Vehicles", *IEEE Conference on Clean Electrical Power*, Page(s):74 - 77, May 2007.
[72] M.C. Kisacikoglu, M. Uzunoglu, M. S. Alam, "Fuzzy Logic Control

[72] M.C. Kisacikoglu, M. Uzunoglu, M. S. Alam, "Fuzzy Logic Control of a Fuel Cell/Battery/Ultra-capacitor Hybrid Vehicular Power System", IEEE *Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s):591 - 596, September 2007.

[73] Lei Wang, Hui Li, "Maximum Fuel Economy-oriented Power Management Design for a Fuel Cell Vehicle Using Battery and Ultracapacitor", *Twenty-Fourth Annual IEEE Applied Power Electronics Conference and Exposition, 2009. APEC 2009.* Page(s):171 – 178. 15-19 Feb. 2009.

[74] W. Lajnef, J.M. Vinassa, O. Briat, H. El Brouji, S. Azzopardi, E.Woirgard, "Quantification of ageing of ultracapacitors during cycling tests with current profile characteristics of hybrid and electric vehicles applications", *IEEE Electric Power Applications*, page(s):683 - 689, Vol. 1, No 5, September 2007.

[75] V.V. Haerri, D. Martinovic, "Supercapacitor Module SAM for Hybrid Busses: an Advanced Energy Storage Specification based on Experiences with the TOHYCO-Rider Bus Project", *IEEE conference of Industrial Electronics Society*, Page(s):268 – 273, November 2007.

[76] J.A.Hicks; R.Gruich; A.Oldja; D.Myers; T.T.Hartley; R.Veillette; I.Husain; "Ultracapacitor Energy Management and Controller Developments for a Series-Parallel 2-by-2 Hybrid Electric Vehicle", *IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s):328 – 335, September 2007.

[77] M. Ortuzar, J. Moreno, J. Dixon, "Ultracapacitor-Based Auxiliary Energy System for an Electric Vehicle: Implementation and Evaluation", *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*, Page(s):2147 - 2156, Vol. 54, No. 4, August 2007.

[78] Juergen Auer, and John Miller, "Ultracapacitor-based energy management strategies for eCVT hybrid vehicles", *IEEE Conference onAutomotive Electronics*, Page(s):1 - 11, June 2007.

[79] J.M. Miller, M. Everett, J. Auer, "Ultracapacitor Enabled Gatekeeper Energy Management Strategy for Single Mode eCVT Hybrid Vehicle Propulsion", *IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s):1-6, September.

[80] Jennifer Bauman, and Mehrdad Kazerani, "A Comparative Study of Fuel-Cell–Battery, Fuel-Cell–Ultracapacitor, and Fuel-Cell–Battery– Ultracapacitor Vehicles", *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, Page(s): 760-769 vol. 57, No. 2, March 2008.

[81] Baek-Haeng Lee, Dong-Hyun Shin, Byeong-Woo Kim, Hee-Jun Kim, Byoung-Kuk Lee, Chung-Yuen Won, Jin Hur, "A Study on Hybrid Energy Storage System for 42V Automotive Power-net", *IEEE Vehicle Power and Propulsion Conference*, Page(s):1 - 5 september 2006.

[82] Shuai Lu; K.A. Corzine, M. Ferdowsi, "An Unique Ultracapacitor Direct Integration Scheme in Multilevel Motor Drives for Large Vehicle Propulsion", *IEEE Conference on Industry Applications*, Page(s):2419 -2426, Vol. 5, October 2006.

[83] Rajkumar Copparapu, Donald S. Zinger, Anima Bose, "Energy Storage Analysis of a Fuel Cell Hybrid Vehicle with Constant Force Acceleration Profile", *IEEE Power Symposium*, Page(s):43 – 47 September 2006.

[84] J. Moreno, M.E. Ortuzar, J.W. Dixon,"Energy-management system for a hybrid electric vehicle, using ultracapacitors and neural networks", *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*, Page(s):614-623, Vol.53,April 2006.

[85]M. Amirabadi, S. Farhangi, "Fuzzy Control of a Hybrid Power Source for Fuel Cell Electric Vehicle using Regenerative Braking Ultracapacitor", *IEEE Power Electronics and Motion Control Conference*, Page(s):1389 - 1394, August 2006.

[86]A. Abedini, A. Nasiri, "Modeling and Analysis of Hybrid Fuel Cell Systems for Vehicular Applications", *IEEE Conference on Vehicle Power and Propulsion*, Page(s):1 - 6, September 2006.

[87]Y. Wu, H. Gao, "Optimization of Fuel Cell and Supercapacitor for Fuel-Cell Electric Vehicles", *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, Page(s):1748 - 1755, Vol. 55, No. 6, November 2006.

[88] Wang Feng, Zhang Tong, Wang Yan-jie, Yang Lin, Zhuo Bin, "Steady-State Optimization of Internal Combustion Engine for Hybrid Electric Vehicles", *IEEE Conference on Vehicular Electronics and Safety*. Page(s):428 – 433, December 2006.

[89] H.Mehrjerdi, J.Ghouili, "Strategies Comparison for Optimization of Multi Objective Function in a Fuel Cell Electrical Vehicle", *IEEE Conference on Electrical and Computer Engineering*, Page(s):1337-341, May 2006.

[90] M.B. Camara, F. Gustin, H. Gualous, and A. Berthon, "Supercapacitors and battery power management for hybrid vehicle applications using multi boost and full bridge converters," *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics and Applications*, Page(s):1 - 9, September 2007 [91]M. A. Dehaghi, R. Rajaei, A. Ansari, "A New Buck-and-Boost Ultracapacitor Interface Circuit for the HEVs", *IEEE Conference on Industrial Electronics and Applications*, Page(s): 3382 – 3387, May 2009.

[92] P. Thounthong, S. Rael, B. Davat," Analysis of Supercapacitor as Second Source Based on Fuel Cell Power Generation", *IEEE transactions on Energy Conversion*, Volume 24, Issue 1, Page(s): 247 - 255, March 2009.

[93] J.M. Miller, U. Deshpande, T.J. Dougherty, T. Bohn, "Power Electronic Enabled Active Hybrid Energy Storage System and its Economic Viability", IEEE Conference on Applied Power Electronics, Page(s):190 - 198, Feb. 2009.

[94]F. Rafik, H. Gualous, R. Gallay, A. Crausaz, A. Berthon, "Supercapacitors characterization for hybrid vehicle applications", *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics and Motion Control*, Page(s):1-5, Vol.3, August 2006.

[95] Yun Zhong, Jiancheng Zhang, Gengyin Li, Xindi Yuan, "Mathematical model of new bi-directional DC-AC-DC converter for supercapacitor energy storage system in photovoltaic generation", *IEEE Conference on Electric Utility Deregulation and Restructuring and* Power Technologies, Page(s): 2686-2690, April 2008

[96] J. Xue, Z. Yin, B. wu, Z. wu, J. Ii,"Technology Research Of Novel Energy Storage Control For The PV Generation System", *Asia-Pacific Power and Energy Engineering Conference, 2009. APPEEC 2009.* Page(s):1 – 4. 27-31 March 2009.

[97]Qi Xin-chun, Qi Zhi-ping, Li Haidong, "Asymmetric hybrid supercapacitor (AHS)'s modeling based on physical reasoning", *IEEE Conference on Electric Utility Deregulation and Restructuring and Power Technologies*, Page(s): 2682 – 2685, April 2008.

[98]M. E. Glavin, W.G. Hurley, "Ultracapacitor/ battery hybrid for solar energy storage", *IEEE Conference on Universities Power Engineering*, Page(s): 791-795, September 2007.

[99] M.E. Ortuzar, R.E. Carmi, J. W. Dixon, L. Moran, "Voltage-source active power filter based on multilevel converter and ultracapacitor DC link", IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics, Page(s):477-485, April 2006.

[100] H. Tao, J.L. Duarte, M. A. M. Hendrix, "Line-Interactive UPS Using a Fuel Cell as the Primary Source", *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*, Page(s): 3012-3021, vol. 55, No 8, August 2008.

[101]H. Tao, J.L. Duarte, M. A. M. Hendrix, "A Distributed Fuel Cell Based Generation and Compensation System to Improve Power Quality", *IEEE Power Electronics and Motion Control Conference*, Page(s):1-5, vol. 2, August 2006

[102]Xi Zhengping, B. Parkhideh, D. Bhattacharya, "Improving distribution system performance with integrated STATCOM and supercapacitor energy storage system," *IEEE Conference on Power Electronics Specialists*, Page(s):1390 - 1395, June 2008

[103]B. Parkhideh, S. Bhattacharya,Han Chong, "Integration of supercapacitor with STATCOM for electric arc furnace flicker mitigation", *IEEE Power Electronics Specialists Conference*, Page(s):2242 - 2247, June 2008

[104]Phinit Srithorn, Mark Sumner,Liangzhong Yao, Parashar, Ram,"The control of a STATCOM with supercapacitor energy storage for improved power quality", *IEEE SmartGrids for Distribution*, Page(s):1-4,June 2008

[105] H.Tao, J.L.Duarte, M.A.M.Hendrix, "A Distributed Fuel Cell Based Generation and Compensation System to Improve Power Quality", *IEEE Power Electronics and Motion Control Conference*, Page(s):1 - 5, vol. 2, August 2006

[106]Yanqiu Li, Hongyun Yu, Bo Su, and Yonghong Shang", Hybrid Micropower Source for Wireless Sensor Network", *IEEE Sensors Journal*, Page(s): 678-681, vol 8, No 6, June 2008.

[107] V. Martynyuk, "Supercapacitor Data Acquisition Systems", *IEEE Intelligent Data Acquisition and Advanced Computing Systems: Technology and Applications*, Page(s): 24-28, September 2007

[108]J. Locker, T. Wolfe, "Development of an Ultracapacitor-Based Intermediate Energy Storage System", *IEEE Pulsed Power Conference*, Page(s):1337-1340, June 2005.

[109]Z. Zhang, O.C. Thomsen, M.A. E. Andersen, J.D. Schmid, H.R. Nielsen, "Analysis and Design of Bi-directional DC-DC Converter in Extended Run Time DC UPS System Based on Fuel Cell and Supercapacitor", *Twenty-Fourth Annual IEEE Applied Power Electronics Conference and Exposition, 2009. APEC 2009.* Page(s): 714-719. 15-19 Feb. 2009.

Authors: eng. Miguel A Guerrero, <u>mguerrmar@peandes.unex.es;</u> dr eng. Enrique Romero, <u>eromero@unex.es;</u> dr eng. Fermín Barrero, <u>fbarrero@unex.es;</u> dr eng. María Isabel Milanés, <u>milanes@unex.es;</u> dr eng. Eva González, <u>evagzlez@unex.es.</u> University of Extremadura, School of Industrial Engineering, Avda. Elvas s/n 06006 Badajoz.